

SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

REPORT TO: Planning Committee

11 May 2016

AUTHOR/S: Planning and New Communities Director

Application Number: S/2689/15/FL

Parish(es): Haslingfield

Proposal: Demolish existing bungalow and replace with a two storey dwelling

Site address: 115 New Road, Haslingfield, CB23 1LP

Applicant(s): Mr & Mrs Miller

Recommendation: Approval

Key material considerations: Planning Policy and Principle, Visual Amenity, Residential Amenity, Highway Safety and Impact on Settings of Adjacent Listed Buildings

Committee Site Visit: 10 May 2016

Departure Application: No

Presenting Officer: Thorfinn Caithness, Principal Planning Officer

Application brought to Committee because: The recommendation of Haslingfield Parish Council conflicts with the Officer recommendation.

Date by which decision due: 20 May 2016 (extension of time agreed)

Executive Summary

1. The application proposes the erection of a replacement dwelling, involving the demolition of an existing bungalow and its replacement with a two storey detached house. The application is a product of favourable pre-application advice and the submitted proposals are reflective of the pre-application discussions with the applicant.
2. The scheme seeks to create a family sized dwelling within the village framework of Haslingfield on New Road, where there are a variety of types, sizes and ages of properties. It is considered that although the proposals represent a significant change compared to the existing modest bungalow on the plot, the site and the wider street scene is, on balance, capable of satisfactorily absorbing the proposed new dwelling without causing undue harm to local character and amenity.
3. The application site is situated adjacent to two Listed Buildings, nos. 117 and 121 New Road. Regard has been had to the impact of the proposals on the settings of these Listed Buildings and the proposals are considered to be satisfactory in this regard. The

proposals are therefore considered to be acceptable in relation to the requirements of Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Act) 1990, which requires decision-makers to pay 'special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses'.

4. Regard has been had to the privacy and residential amenities of surrounding residential neighbours and the proposals are considered to be satisfactory in relation to this important material planning consideration.
5. The application is considered to comprise a sustainable form of development, in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework and the adopted Development Plan and there are considered to be no other material considerations to indicate otherwise.

Planning History

6. RC/0105/60 – Full Planning - Erection of bungalow with garage – Approved 27-04-1960.

PRE/0415/14 – Replacement Dwelling – Answered 01-09-2014.

National Guidance

7. National Planning Policy Framework 2012 (NPPF)
Planning Practice Guidance

Development Plan Policies

8. **South Cambridgeshire LDF Core Strategy DPD, 2007**
ST/3 Re-Using Previously Developed Land and Buildings
ST/6 Group Villages
9. **South Cambridgeshire LDF Development Control Policies DPD, 2007:**
DP/1 Sustainable Development
DP/2 Design of New Development
DP/3 Development Criteria
DP/4 Infrastructure and New Developments
DP/7 Development Frameworks
HG/1 Housing Density
HG/2 Housing Mix
NE/1 Energy Efficiency
NE/6 Biodiversity
NE/9 Water and Drainage Infrastructure
CH/4 Development Within the Curtilage or Setting of a Listed Building
TR/1 Planning For More Sustainable Travel
TR/2 Car and Cycle Parking Standards
SF/10 Outdoor Playspace, Informal Open Space, and New Developments
SF/11 Open Space Standards
10. **South Cambridgeshire LDF Supplementary Planning Documents (SPD):**
District Design Guide - Adopted March 2010
Open Space in New Developments SPD - Adopted January 2009
Landscape in New Developments SPD - Adopted March 2010
Biodiversity SPD - Adopted July 2009

11. **South Cambridgeshire Local Plan Submission - March 2014**

S/1 Vision

S/2 Objectives of the Local Plan

S/3 Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development

S/7 Development Frameworks

S/10 Group Villages

HQ/1 Design Principles

NH/4 Biodiversity

NH14 Heritage Assets

H/11 Residential Space Standards for Market Housing

TI/2 Planning for Sustainable Travel

TI/3 Parking Provision

TI/8 Infrastructure and New Developments

SC/6 Indoor Community Facilities

SC/7 Outdoor Play Space, Informal Open Space and New Developments

CC/1 Mitigation and Adaption to Climate Change

CC/6 Construction Methods

CC/7 Water Quality

CC/8 Sustainable Drainage Systems

Consultation

12. **Haslingfield Parish Council**- The principle of a replacement dwelling is acceptable. However, the currently proposed scheme is considered to be contrary to planning policy DP/2 Design of New Development in that the proposals, by way of their scale, mass, form, siting, design, proportions and materials would be inappropriate and incompatible with the location. As a result, the proposals also fail to preserve and enhance the character of the local area as required by the policy. The Parish Council is also concerned that the proposed dwelling would have a negative impact on the residential amenity of the bungalow located adjacent to the application site, given the overbearing nature of the proposed dwelling. The proposals are also considered contrary to planning policy CH/4 Development within the Curtilage or Setting of a Listed Building. The overbearing nature of the proposed dwelling would dominate the adjacent Listed Buildings located at 117 and 121 New Road and negatively impact on the visual relationship between the Listed Buildings and both their formal and natural landscape surroundings. The application fails to illustrate clearly how the proposals will impact on the curtilage and wider setting of the Listed Buildings. The proposals are considered to be contrary to the wider planning objectives of the National Planning Policy Framework - Requiring Good Design, paragraphs 56, 57 and 58 points 1, 4, and 6 in particular.
13. **Local Highways Authority** - No objections subject to conditions relating to the falls and levels and construction material of the driveway and an informative regarding works within the public highway, in the interests of highway safety.
14. **Environmental Health** – No objections subjection to the imposition of conditions to control construction activities, burning of waste and pile foundations, in the interests of residential amenity.
15. **Conservation / Historic Buildings** – The site is occupied by a detached bungalow on New Road. The street has a range of building types and form. Those to the east of the site are modern, where as the dwellings to the west are grade II listed. The site to the west is screened with mature trees and vegetation; however there is no protection

and these could be removed providing clear views between the sites.

16. The proposed replacement dwelling is two storeys in height and of considerable larger scale and massing than existing. The immediate dwelling to the west is a converted dovecote, which has a particularly small footprint. The proposed dwelling is no closer to the listed buildings and includes a single storey element to the west part. Taking this into account and the current screening the development of a two storey dwelling on this site will have minimal impact on the setting of the adjacent listed buildings.

Representations

17. None

Site and Surroundings

18. The application site is located on the south side of New Road in Haslingfield in a well-established residential neighbourhood. The existing property is a bungalow with front and rear gardens and an off street area for parking and turning to the front. The property appears to have been constructed as a pair with 113 New Road.
19. Number 115 New Road comprises a 3-bed bungalow of pitch roof form, constructed of brown facing bricks and grey interlocking concrete roof tiles. All floor space is accommodated at ground floor level. This includes an attached garage and store and a modern upvc rear conservatory located on the south east side of the property next to the boundary with 113 New Road.
20. Number 115 is located on the south side of New Road. It is a building of modest size and appears to have been built as a pair with the neighbouring 113 New Road.
21. On the north side of New Road there is a group of 8 no. two storey properties with hipped roofs, likewise a similar group of larger, two storey hipped roof properties to the east on the same side of New Road as the application site.
22. The existing bungalow occupies a spacious plot with some mature trees and hedges along the northern and wester boundaries.
23. The application site is located within the defined village framework of Haslingfield, as defined by Inset No.50 of the adopted Proposals Map. Haslingfield is classed as a 'Group Village' under Policy ST/6 of the adopted Core Strategy DPD.
24. The prevailing street scene is one within which there are a variety of property types, designs, sizes and ages, including large, two storey modern properties on both sides of the street.
25. To the north west of the application site there are two Grade II Listed Buildings, Nos. 117 and 121 New Road.
26. The site does not lie within a Conservation Area and is not affected by flood risk.

Proposal

27. The application seeks full planning permission for the erection of a replacement, two-storey, detached dwelling at 115 New Road Haslingfield, following demolition of the existing detached bungalow.
28. The application proposals are a product of a pre-application enquiry with the Council which received a positive response from officers. The current proposals fully reflect these pre-submission discussions.
29. The proposed replacement dwelling comprises a detached, two storey house of predominantly hipped roof form. The property will be of 5-bedroom size, with a master en-suite, and attached garage.
30. The property has been designed with the main two storey section of the building positioned centrally within the plot. Smaller single storey sections will cascade down at either side to reduce the size and scale adjacent to the side boundaries.
31. The eaves height of the main two storey section will be 5.3 metres and the maximum ridge height will be 7.9 metres. The smaller single storey sections to the sides will have eaves heights of 2.5 metres and ridge heights of 5.1 metres.

Planning Assessment

32. Applications are to be determined in accordance with the adopted Development Plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. The adopted Development Plan comprises the South Cambridgeshire Core Strategy DPD, 2007, Development Control Policies DPD, 2007 and Site Specific Policies DPD.
33. The emerging Local Plan comprises the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan, Proposed Submission Version, July 2013 and associated Policies Map. This plan has not yet been adopted and remains subject to independent inspection therefore very limited weight can be attached to the policies contained therein at this time.
34. The application has been advertised as affecting the setting of a Listed Building, as required by the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.
35. The key issues in relation to this application are considered to be the principle of development, residential and visual amenity, highway safety and impacts on the setting of Listed Buildings.

Principle of Development

36. At a national planning level, Section 6 of the National Framework seeks to deliver a wide choice of high quality homes. In particular, Section 50 of the NPPF states that local authorities should, amongst other things, plan for a mix of housing based on current and future demographic trends, market trends and the needs of different groups in the community, including in this particular case, people wishing to build their own homes.
37. Section 7 of the National Framework states that the Government attaches great importance to the design of the built environment. Good design is a key aspect of sustainable development, is indivisible from good planning, and should contribute positively to making places better for people. Furthermore, paragraph 58 of the NPPF states that developments should, amongst other things, add to the overall quality of the area, establish a strong sense of place, respond to local character and history,

reflect the identity of local surroundings and materials, while not preventing or discouraging appropriate innovation, and be visually attractive with appropriate landscaping.

38. Paragraph 60 of the NPPF states that planning policies and decisions should not attempt to impose architectural styles or particular tastes and they should not stifle innovation, originality or initiative through unsubstantiated requirements to conform to certain development forms or styles. It is, however, proper to seek to promote or reinforce local distinctiveness. Paragraph 64 of the NPPF states that permission should be refused for development of poor design that fails to take the opportunities available for improving the character and quality of an area and the way it functions.
39. Section 12 of the NPPF seeks to conserve and enhance the Historic Environment. Paragraph 131 of the NPPF states that in determining planning applications, local planning authorities should take account of the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets.
40. At a local level, the application site is located within the defined framework of Haslingfield village, as identified on Inset No. 50 of the adopted Proposals Map, 2010. The principle of demolishing the existing bungalow and erecting a replacement dwelling is therefore considered to be acceptable, and this was reflected in the pre-application response to the applicant.
41. Overall, the principle of a replacement dwelling on this site is considered to be acceptable.

Residential Amenity

42. The proposal has been assessed in regard to neighbour amenity and impact from loss of light, loss of privacy and overbearing impact and it is considered that the proposals would not result in any adverse harm and therefore comply with Policy DP/3 of the LDF.
43. The concerns of the Parish Council with regards to overbearing impacts on 113 New Road are acknowledged, however the replacement dwelling has been designed so that the larger two-storey section is centrally placed within the plot, set in and back from the side boundaries. Whilst the building will be substantially larger, the side sections will be of single storey size and scale which will significantly reduce any impacts on neighbouring properties.
44. Openings in the eastern elevation facing 113 New Road are limited to a garage doorway at ground floor level and 2 (no.) obscurely glazed bathroom / en-suite windows at first floor level. In the western elevation there will be a ground floor door and an obscurely glazed bathroom window at first floor level. Consequentially, there will be no direct overlooking and loss of privacy to 113 or 117 New Road.
45. The new property is located to the north-north-west side of 113 New Road, therefore 113 will continue to receive good levels of daylight and sunlight from the east, south and west.
46. The footprint of the new property will be larger, however the overall plot size is larger and the garden will continue to be of a size and shape commensurate with the size of the proposed larger property.
47. Taking account of the siting, orientation and detailed design of the property it is

considered that impacts on neighbouring residential amenity will be satisfactory.

Visual Amenity

48. The application proposals will introduce a larger and very different building onto the application site in comparison to the existing modest bungalow. This change in scale and proportions is likely to be exaggerated by the continued presence of the immediately adjacent bungalow at 113 New Road, which appears to have been built as a pair with 115 New Road. There is certainly a prevailing unity to 113 and 115 New Road. When viewed in isolation, side by side with 113 New Road, the replacement dwelling could appear significantly larger and somewhat imbalanced and inharmonious with the remaining bungalow. This is certainly the view of the local Parish Council, which considers that the proposals, by way of their scale, mass, form, siting, design, proportions and materials would be inappropriate and incompatible with the location.
49. However, when viewed within the context of the wider overall street scene, which is characterised by a mix of property types, sizes and ages, including modern two storey hipped roof style houses on the opposite side of the street, (including some with roof mounted upvc panels), it is considered, on balance, that the application proposals can be assimilated visually and physically with the wider street scene and surroundings. This is an on-balance decision, reflecting the presence of two storey building forms, scales and proportions within the street scene, combined with the good sized plot within which the application proposals sit and the fact that the proposed dwelling will continue to have domestic scaled proportions reflective of others in the locality.
50. Despite the obvious visual and physical transformation that will result, it is considered that the proposals are acceptable in terms of their design and appearance within the street scene and are therefore in accordance with the relevant policies of the NPPF, the adopted Local Plan and the Council's adopted District Design Guide SPD.

Highway safety and parking

51. There are no objections to the proposal from the Highways Authority. The site comprises an existing domestic property with off-street parking, turning and servicing provision and this will remain the case. A highways condition is advised requiring the proposed driveway to be constructed using a bound material to prevent debris spreading onto the adopted highway.

Impact on Setting of Listed Building

52. Located to the north-north-west of the application site there are two Grade II Listed Buildings; 117 and 121 New Road. Both are domestic properties set within irregularly shaped plots. As already described, the prevailing street scene is one within which there is a varied mix of property types, sizes and ages. The architectural and historic interest, including setting of these two Listed buildings is already appreciated within the context of a street scene where similar modern, two story houses exist and can be seen within the same visual view frame as the modern buildings. Although the application site shares a boundary with 117 New Road, this adjacent building is set back into the plot and is largely screened from view by a combination of this set back and existing boundary planting. It is not considered that the larger building proposed on the application site would physically impose itself of the setting of this Listed Building or encroach in a detrimental way into the landscape or any other setting of this particular Listed Building. This view is shared by the Council's Historic Buildings Section, which confirms that the application proposals will have a minimal impact on

the setting of the two adjacent Listed Buildings.

Conclusion

53. Having regard to relevant national and local planning policies, and having taken all relevant material considerations into account, it is considered that planning permission should be granted in this instance

Recommendation

54. Officers recommend that the Committee grants planning permission, subject to the following:

Conditions

55. (a)The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of 3 years from the date of this permission.
(Reason - To ensure that consideration of any future application for development in the area will not be prejudiced by permissions for development, which have not been acted upon.)

(b)The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: JPT/MIL/0914/002 – ‘Site Plan’ and JPT/MIL/0914/001 – ‘Proposed Plans and Elevations’.

(Reason - To facilitate any future application to the Local Planning Authority under Section 73 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.)

(c)No development shall commence until details of the materials to be used in the construction of the external surfaces of the buildings hereby permitted have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

(Reason – To ensure the appearance of the development is satisfactory in accordance with Policy DP/2 of the adopted Local Development Framework 2007).

(d)No development shall take place until full details of both hard and soft landscape works have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. These details shall include indications of all existing trees and hedgerows on the land and details of any to be retained, together with measures for their protection in the course of development. The details shall also include specification of all proposed trees, hedges and shrub planting, which shall include details of species, density and size of stock.

(Reason - To ensure the development is satisfactorily assimilated into the area and enhances biodiversity in accordance with Policies DP/2 and NE/6 of the adopted Local Development Framework 2007.)

(e)All hard and soft landscape works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details. The works shall be carried out prior to the occupation of any part of the development or in accordance with a programme agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority. If within a period of five years from the date of the planting, or replacement planting, any tree or plant is removed, uprooted or destroyed or dies, another tree or plant of the same species and size as that originally planted shall be planted at the same place, unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.

(Reason - To ensure the development is satisfactorily assimilated into the area and enhances biodiversity in accordance with Policies DP/2 and NE/6 of the adopted Local Development Framework 2007.)

(f) No construction site machinery or plant shall be operated, no noisy works shall be carried out and no construction related deliveries taken at or despatched from the site except between the hours of 08.00 – 18.00 Monday to Friday, 08.00 – 13.00 Saturday and not at any time on Sundays or Bank or Public Holidays.

(Reason – To protect the amenity of the locality, especial for people living and / or working nearby, in accordance with Policy DP/3 of the adopted Local Development Framework 2007.)

(g) Should driven pile foundations be proposed, then before works commence, a statement of the method for construction of these foundations shall be submitted and agreed by the District Environmental Health Officer.

(Reason - To minimise disturbance for adjoining residents in accordance with Policy DP/3 of the adopted Local Development Framework 2007.)

(h) There shall be no burning of any waste or other materials on the site, without prior consent from the environmental health department.

Reason - To minimise disturbance for adjoining residents in accordance with Policy DP/3 of the adopted Local Development Framework 2007.)

(i) Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (England) Order 2015 (or any order revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification), no development within Classes A, B, or C of Part 1 of Schedule 2 of the Order shall take place and no new window openings shall be created at first floor level in the north western and south eastern elevations of the dwelling hereby approved, unless expressly authorised by planning permission granted by the Local Planning Authority in that behalf.

(Reason - In the interests of residential and visual amenity in accordance with Policy DP/2 and CH/5 of the adopted Local Development Framework 2007.)

Informatives

56. (1) The applicant should take all relevant precautions to minimise the potential for disturbance to neighbouring residents in terms of noise and dust during the construction phases of development. This should include the use of water suppression for any stone or brick cutting and advising neighbours in advance of any particularly noisy works. The granting of this planning permission does not indemnify against statutory nuisance action being taken should substantiated noise or dust complaints be received. For further information please contact the Environmental Health Service.

(2) Before any existing buildings are demolished, a Demolition Notice will be required from the Building Control Section of the Council's planning department establishing the way in which the property will be dismantled, including any asbestos present, the removal of waste, minimisation of dust, capping of drains and establishing hours of working operation.

(3) The granting of planning permission does not constitute a permission or licence to a developer to carry out any works within, or disturbance of, or interference with, the Public Highway. A separate permission must be sought from the Highway Authority for such works.

Background Papers:

The following list contains links to the documents on the Council's website and / or an

indication as to where hard copies can be inspected.

- South Cambridgeshire Local Development Framework Development Control Policies DPD 2007
- South Cambridgeshire Local Development Framework Supplementary Planning Documents (SPD's)
- South Cambridgeshire Local Plan Submission 2014

Report Author:

Thorfinn Caithness
Telephone Number:

Principal Planning Officer
01954 713126